

1. For each of the following indicate symbolically what you would assume for each proof method: Direct, by contrapositive and by contradiction.

(a)  $\forall x, P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)$

Solution:

Direct:  $P(x)$

Contrapositive:  $\sim Q(x)$

Contradiction:  $\exists x, P(x) \wedge (\sim Q(x))$

(b)  $P \rightarrow (Q \vee R)$

Solution:

Direct:  $P$

Contrapositive:  $(\sim Q) \wedge (\sim R)$ .

Contradiction:  $P \wedge ((\sim Q) \wedge (\sim R))$

(c)  $\forall x, \exists y, P(x, y) \rightarrow (Q(x, y) \wedge R(x, y))$

Solution:

Direct:  $P(x, y)$

Contrapositive:  $(\sim Q(x, y)) \vee (\sim R(x, y))$

Contradiction:  $\exists x, \forall y, P(x, y) \wedge ((\sim Q(x, y)) \vee (\sim R(x, y)))$

(d)  $\forall x, (P(x) \vee Q(x)) \rightarrow R(x)$

Solution:

Direct:  $P(x) \vee Q(x)$

Contrapositive:  $\sim R(x)$

Contradiction:  $\exists x, (P(x) \vee Q(x)) \wedge (\sim R(x))$

(e)  $\forall x, P(x) \vee (Q(x) \rightarrow R(x))$

Solution: Note this was trickier than intended since it's not an implication as written and we need to rewrite it. Without the  $x$  for clarity:

$$P \vee (Q \rightarrow R) = P \vee ((\sim Q) \vee R) = (P \vee (\sim Q)) \vee R = \sim (P \vee (\sim Q)) \rightarrow R$$

Direct:  $\sim (P(x) \vee (\sim Q(x)))$

Contrapositive:  $\sim R(x)$

Contradiction:  $\exists x, (\sim (P(x) \vee (\sim Q(x)))) \wedge (\sim R(x))$

2. Prove that for  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$  that if  $a|(b+c)$  and  $a \nmid b$  then  $a \nmid c$ .

Proof: We proceed by contradiction assuming that there are  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$  with  $a|(b+c)$ ,  $a \nmid b$  and  $a|c$ . Then  $ak = b+c$  for  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  and  $aj = c$  for  $j \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Then  $ak = b+c = b+aj$  so  $ak - aj = b$  so  $a(k-j) = b$  and so  $a|b$ , a contradiction. QED

3. Prove that if  $a$  and  $b$  are odd integers then  $4 \nmid (a^2 + b^2)$ .

Proof: We proceed by contradiction assuming that  $a$  and  $b$  are odd and  $4 \mid (a^2 + b^2)$ . We have  $a = 2k + 1$  and  $b = 2j + 1$  for  $j, k \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Then

$$a^2 + b^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 + 4j^2 + 4j + 1 = 4(k^2 + k + j^2 + j) + 2$$

so  $4 \nmid (a^2 + b^2)$ , a contradiction. *QED*

Note: This could be done directly and would be essentially the same.

4. Prove that the sum of the two legs of a right triangle must be greater than the hypotenuse.

Proof: We proceed by contradiction assuming we have a right triangle with legs  $a$  and  $b$  and hypotenuse  $c$  such that  $c \geq a + b$ . Squaring both sides and applying the Pythagorean Theorem yields

$$c^2 \geq (a + b)^2 = a^2 + 2ab + b^2 = c^2 + 2ab$$

from whence it follows that  $2ab \leq 0$  which is impossible since  $a, b > 0$ . *QED*

5. Prove that  $\sqrt{3}$  is irrational. Just as with our proof with  $\sqrt{2}$  you will need a lemma. State and prove this lemma as part of your solution.

Lemma: For  $a \in \mathbb{Z}$  we have  $3 \mid a^2$  iff  $3 \mid a$ .

Proof: First we prove if  $3 \mid a$  then  $3 \mid a^2$ : If  $3 \mid a$  then  $a = 3k$  for  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  so then  $a^2 = 9k^2 = 3(3k^2)$  so  $3 \mid a^2$ .

Next we prove if  $3 \nmid a^2$  then  $3 \nmid a$  by proving the contrapositive, if  $3 \nmid a$  then  $3 \nmid a^2$ . There are two cases if  $3 \nmid a$ . First, if  $a = 3k + 1$  for  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  then  $a^2 = 9k^2 + 6k + 1 = 3(3k^2 + 2k) + 1$  so  $3 \nmid a^2$ . Second, if  $a = 3k + 2$  for  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  then  $a^2 = 9k^2 + 12k + 4 = 3(3k^2 + 4k + 1) + 1$  so  $3 \nmid a^2$ .

Proof of Problem: We proceed by contradiction, assuming that  $\sqrt{3}$  is rational. If so, then  $\sqrt{3} = \frac{a}{b}$  with  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$  in lowest terms. Then we have  $3 = \frac{a^2}{b^2}$  and so  $3b^2 = a^2$  which tells us  $3 \mid a^2$  so  $3 \mid a$  by the lemma. This then gives us  $a = 3k$  for  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  and so  $3b^2 = (3k)^2 = 9k^2$  so  $b^2 = 3k^2$  so  $3 \mid b^2$  and so  $3 \mid b$ . But we cannot have  $3 \mid a$  and  $3 \mid b$  since  $\frac{a}{b}$  is in lowest terms. *QED*

6. Prove there does not exist a real number  $x$  such that  $x^6 + x^4 + 1 = 2x^2$ .

Proof: Assume by way of contradiction that we do. Then

$$\begin{aligned} x^6 + x^4 + 1 &= 2x^2 \\ x^6 + x^4 - 2x^2 + 1 &= 0 \\ x^6 + (x^2 - 1)^2 &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

Since both summands have even powers both are nonnegative. But since the sum is zero they both must equal zero. The first tells us  $x = 0$  while the second tells us  $x = \pm 1$ . This is a contradiction. *QED*

7. Prove that the equation  $x^3 + x + 1 = 0$  has a real solution but no rational solution.  
Hint: For the second part, if  $\frac{p}{q}$  is such a root in lowest terms examine the parities of  $p$  and  $q$ .

Proof: First observe that when  $x = 0$  we have  $x^3 + x + 1 = 1 > 0$  and when  $x = -1$  we have  $x^3 + x + 1 = -1$  so, since  $x^3 + x + 1$  is continuous, by the Intermediate Value Theorem we know there is an  $x \in (-1, 0)$  with  $x^3 + x + 1 = 0$ .

For the second part we proceed by contradiction. Assume that  $x = \frac{a}{b}$  is a rational solution with  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$  in lowest terms. So then we have

$$\begin{aligned} x^3 + x + 1 &= 0 \\ \left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^3 + \left(\frac{a}{b}\right) + 1 &= 0 \\ a^3 + ab^2 + b^3 &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

Now consider the parities of  $a$  and  $b$ . Since  $\frac{a}{b}$  is in lowest terms they're not both even and so we have three cases with  $j, k \in \mathbb{Z}$ :

Case 1:  $a = 2j + 1$  and  $b = 2j + 1$ : Then  $a^3 + ab^2 + b^3 = 2(4j^3 + 6j^2 + 4j + 4jk^2 + 4jk + 8k^2 + 5k + 4k^3 + 1) + 1$  which is odd and hence not zero.

Case 2:  $a = 2j + 1$  and  $b = 2j$ : Then  $a^3 + ab^2 + b^3 = 2(4j^3 + 6j^2 + 3j + 4jk^2 + 2k^2 + 4k^3) + 1$  which is odd and hence not zero.

Case 3:  $a = 2j$  and  $b = 2j + 1$ : Then  $a^3 + ab^2 + b^3 = 2(4j^3 + 4jk^2 + 4jk + j + 4k^3 + 6k^2 + k) + 1$  which is odd and hence not zero. *QED*

8. Suppose I have a list of real numbers, all between 0 and 1, listed with decimal expansion as follows, with each variable representing a digit:

$$\begin{aligned} &0.a_{11}a_{12}a_{13}\dots \\ &0.a_{21}a_{22}a_{23}\dots \\ &0.a_{31}a_{32}a_{33}\dots \\ &\dots \end{aligned}$$

Prove there exists a real number not in the list.

Proof: Construct a new number  $0.a_1a_2\dots$  as follow:

Let  $a_1$  be a digit which is not  $a_{11}$ .

Let  $a_2$  be a digit which is not  $a_{22}$ .

Let  $a_3$  be a digit which is not  $a_{33}$ .

And so on. Then clearly this new number is not in the list since it differs from the  $n^{\text{th}}$  number at the  $n^{\text{th}}$  digit. *QED*

9. Prove that there are infinitely many  $x, y \in \mathbb{Z}$  with  $4x - 6y = 14$ .

Proof: We see a pattern in the solutions:

$$x = 5, y = 1$$

$$x = 8, y = 3$$

$$x = 11, y = 5 \text{ And so it looks like } x = 5 + 3t, y = 1 + 2t \text{ for } t \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ works. We check:}$$

$$4(5 + 3t) - 6(1 + 2t) = 20 + 12t - 6 - 12t = 14$$

and it works. *QED*